



Immokalee Fire Control District Impact Fee Update Study

FINAL REPORT

July 12, 2023



Prepared for:

Immokalee Fire Control District
5368 Useppa Drive
Ave Maria, Florida 34142
ph (239) 657-2111

Prepared by:

Benesch
1000 N. Ashley Drive, #400
Tampa, Florida 33602
ph (813) 224-8862
E-mail: nkamp@benesch.com

**Immokalee Fire Control District
Fire Impact Fee Update Study
Table of Contents**

INTRODUCTION	1
FACILITY INVENTORY	5
SERVICE AREA.....	8
LEVEL OF SERVICE	8
COST COMPONENT	9
NET IMPACT COST.....	10
DEMAND COMPONENT.....	11
CALCULATED FIRE IMPACT FEE SCEHDULE	12
IMPACT FEE SCHEDULE COMPARISON	13

APPENDIX A: Building and Land Value Analysis - Supplemental Information

Introduction

Fire impact fees are used to fund capital expansion projects for fire rescue service-related facilities, land, vehicles and capital equipment required to support the additional demand created by new growth.

The Immokalee Fire Control District (IFCD or the “District”) was established as an independent special taxing district by the State of Florida in 1955 and codified through legislation in 2000, Laws of Florida, 2001-330. In 2001, noting the need for adequate revenue sources to fund expansion of fire services to serve new growth; legislation amended Chapter 2000-393 Laws of Florida to allow Immokalee Fire District the opportunity to use impact fees as provided in Florida Statutes 191. The District’s current fees are based on a 2006 Study. Due to the changes to the impact fee variables since 2006, the IFCD retained Benesch to conduct an update study. This report presents the results of the Immokalee Fire Control District Impact Fee Update Study and serves as the technical support document in updating the fire impact fee ordinance.

Methodology

The methodology used to update the fire impact fee is a consumption-based impact fee methodology, which has also been used to calculate the current adopted fire impact fee for the District as well as several fire/EMS impact fees throughout Florida, including fees adopted by other fire districts in Collier County as well as Manatee, Orange, Hernando, Palm Beach, Indian River and Lee Counties, among others. A consumption-based impact fee is intended to charge new growth the proportionate share of cost associated with providing fire rescue facilities available for use by new growth.

Legal Overview

In Florida, legal requirements related to impact fees have primarily been established through case law since the 1980’s. Impact fees must comply with the “dual rational nexus” test, which requires that they:

- Be supported by a study demonstrating that the fees are proportionate in amount to the need created by new development paying the fee; and
- Be spent in a manner that directs a proportionate benefit to new development, typically accomplished through establishment of benefit districts (if needed) and a list

of capacity-adding projects included in Capital Improvements Programs or another planning document/Master Plan.

In 2006, the Florida legislature passed the “Florida Impact Fee Act,” which recognized impact fees as “an outgrowth of home rule power of a local government to provide certain services within its jurisdiction.” § 163.31801(2), Fla. Stat. The statute – concerned with mostly procedural and methodological limitations – did not expressly allow or disallow any particular public facility type from being funded with impact fees. The Act did specify procedural and methodological prerequisites, such as the requirement of the fee being based on most recent and localized data, a 90-day requirement for fee changes, and other similar requirements, most of which were common to the practice already.

Subsequent legislation further affected the impact fee framework in Florida, including the following:

- **HB 227 in 2009:** The Florida legislation statutorily clarified that in any action challenging an impact fee, the government has the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence that the imposition or amount of the fee meets the requirements of state legal precedent or the Impact Fee Act and that the court may not use a deferential standard.
- **SB 360 in 2009:** Allowed fees to be decreased without the 90-day notice period required to increase the fees and purported to change the standard of legal review associated with impact fees. SB 360 also required the Florida Department of Community Affairs (now the Department of Economic Opportunity) and Florida Department of Transportation (FDOT) to conduct studies on “mobility fees,” which were completed in 2010.
- **HB 7207 in 2011:** Required a dollar-for-dollar credit, for purposes of concurrency compliance, for impact fees paid and other concurrency mitigation required.
- **HB 319 in 2013:** Applied mostly to concurrency management authorities, but also encouraged local governments to adopt alternative mobility systems using a series of tools identified in section 163.3180(5)(f), Florida Statutes.
- **HB 207 in 2019:** Included the following changes to the Impact Fee Act along with additional clarifying language:
 1. Impact fees cannot be collected prior to building permit issuance; and
 2. Impact fee revenues cannot be used to pay debt service for previously approved projects unless the expenditure is reasonably connected to, or has a rational nexus with, the increased impact generated by the new residential

and commercial construction.

- **HB 7103 in 2019:** Addressed multiple issues related to affordable housing/linkage fees, impact fees, and building services fees. In terms of impact fees, the bill required that when local governments increase their impact fees, the outstanding impact fee credits for developer contributions should also be increased. This requirement was to operate prospectively; however, HB 337 that was signed in 2021 deleted this clause and making all outstanding credits eligible for this adjustment. This bill also allowed local governments to waive/reduce impact fees for affordable housing projects without having to offset the associated revenue loss.
- **SB 1066 in 2020:** Added language allowing impact fee credits to be assignable and transferable at any time after establishment from one development or parcel to another that is within the same impact fee zone or impact fee district or that is within an adjoining impact fee zone or district within the same local government jurisdiction. In addition, added language indicating any new/increased impact fee not being applicable to current or pending permit applications submitted prior to the effective date of an ordinance or resolution imposing new/increased fees.
- **HB 1339 in 2020:** Required reporting of various impact fee related data items within the annual financial audit report submitted to the Department of Financial Services.
- **HB 337 in 2021:** Placed limits on the amount and frequency of fee increases, but also included a clause to exceed these restrictions if the local governments can demonstrate extraordinary circumstances, hold two public workshops discussing these circumstances and the increases are approved by two-thirds of the governing body.

Impact Fee Definition

- An impact fee is a one-time capital charge levied against new development.
- An impact fee is designed to cover the portion of the capital costs of infrastructure capacity consumed by new development.
- The principal purpose of an impact fee is to assist in funding the implementation of projects identified in the capital improvement programs for the respective facility/service categories.

Impact Fee vs. Tax

- An impact fee is generally regarded as a regulatory function established based upon the specific benefit to the user related to a given infrastructure type and is not

established for the primary purpose of generating revenue for the general benefit of the community, as are taxes.

- Impact fee expenditures must convey a proportional benefit to the fee payer. This is accomplished through the establishment of benefit districts, where fees collected in a benefit district are spent in the same benefit district.
- An impact fee must be tied to a proportional need for new infrastructure capacity created by new development.

The impact fee calculations contained in this report are based on the most current and localized data available, consistent with the 2006 Florida Impact Fee Act. Should one or more variables affecting the impact fee change significantly, a recalculation of the impact fee would be necessary prior to the scheduled update of the study. Changes that could potentially trigger a recalculation of the impact fee include, but are not limited to, a considerable change in costs, in amount or sources of revenue available for expansion, or a decision to incur additional debt to fund new capacity.

There are several major elements associated with the development of the fire impact fee. These include:

- Facility Inventory
- Service Area
- Level of Service
- Cost Component
- Credit Component
- Demand Component
- Calculated Fire Impact Fee Schedule
- Impact Fee Schedule Comparison

These various elements are summarized in the remainder of this report, with the result being the calculated fire impact fee schedule.

Facility Inventory

According to information provided by the IFCD, the District owns and operates 3 stations to provide fire related services.

Table 1 shows a summary of the IFCD building inventory included in the impact fee calculations. As presented, the inventory includes a total of 45,700 square feet of building space and 5.5 acres of land. Although a total of 5.5 acres is associated with fire rescue stations, station 32 and the logistics building are located on county-owned land and thus this land is excluded from the impact fee calculations. The total district-owned land being used for fire facilities is 2.1 acres.

An important part of the impact fee calculations involves determining the current value of the capital assets. To determine the building value, Benesch reviewed recent construction completed by the IFCD as well as other fire departments/districts throughout the state, construction cost estimates for future stations, insurance values of existing stations, and discussions with District staff. This analysis resulted in a cost estimate of \$430 per square foot for fire stations. Further detail on this estimate is provided in Appendix A.

Land values were determined through a review of the following:

- The land value of parcels where the current fire stations are located, obtained from the Collier County Property Appraiser's database;
- Appraisals for recent land acquisitions
- Vacant land sales and land values of all vacant land of similar size; and
- Land use characteristics of the areas where future fire stations will be located.

Based upon this information and review, the land value is estimated at \$40,000 per acre for impact fee calculations.

Appendix A provides more detailed information on the land value analysis conducted.

**Table 1
Building and Land Inventory**

Facility ⁽¹⁾	Address ⁽¹⁾	Number of Bays ⁽¹⁾	Square Footage ⁽²⁾	Total Acres ⁽³⁾	Owned Acres ⁽⁴⁾	Building Value ⁽⁵⁾	Land Value ⁽⁶⁾	Total Building and Land Value ⁽⁷⁾
Station 30	510 New Market Rd East Immokalee	3	12,884	0.91	0.91	\$5,540,120	\$36,400	\$5,576,520
Station 31	1107 Carson Road Immokalee	2	3,640	1.20	1.20	\$1,565,200	\$48,000	\$1,613,200
Headquarters: Station 32 ⁽⁸⁾	5368 Useppa Drive Ave Maria	3	23,988	3.40	N/A	\$10,314,840	N/A	\$10,314,840
Headquarters: Logistics Bldg ⁽⁸⁾			5,156			\$2,217,080		\$2,217,080
Total		8	45,668	5.51	2.11	\$19,637,240	\$84,400	\$19,721,640
Building Value per Square Foot⁽⁹⁾						\$430		
Land Value per Acre⁽¹⁰⁾							\$40,000	

- 1) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District
- 2) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District
- 3) Source: Collier County Property Appraiser
- 4) Acres owned by Immokalee Fire Control District
- 5) Square footage (Item 2) multiplied by the estimated building value per square foot (Item 9)
- 6) Owned acres (Item 4) multiplied by the estimated land value per acre (Item 10)
- 7) Sum of the building value (Item 5) and land value (Item 6)
- 8) Land is leased from Collier County
- 9) Building value estimated at \$430 per square foot. See Appendix A for additional details.
- 10) Land value estimated at \$40,000 per acre. See Appendix A for additional details.

In addition to the buildings and land inventory, the IFCD also has the necessary vehicles and equipment to perform its fire rescue services. Table 2 summarizes the total vehicle and equipment inventory value. As shown, the value of fire rescue services related vehicles and equipment is estimated at \$6.7 million.

Table 2
Vehicle and Equipment Inventory

Description ⁽¹⁾	Units ⁽¹⁾	Unit Value ⁽²⁾	Total Value ⁽³⁾
Administration Vehicles			
Pickup Truck	5	\$107,800	\$539,000
Car	1	\$17,900	\$17,900
SUV	4	\$98,200	\$392,800
Side By Side	1	\$35,600	\$35,600
Golf Cart	1	\$23,000	\$23,000
Subtotal -- Administration Vehicles			\$1,008,300
Fire Apparatus			
Engine	3	\$972,800	\$2,918,400
Ladder	1	\$1,499,600	\$1,499,600
Attack Truck	2	\$162,500	\$325,000
Subtotal -- Fire Apparatus			\$4,743,000
Additional Equipment			
Fuel Trailer - 500 Gallons Diesel	1	\$16,500	\$16,500
Water Tender	2	\$464,600	\$929,200
Subtotal -- Additional Equipment			\$945,700
Total Asset Value			\$6,697,000

- 1) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District
- 2) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District
- 3) Units (Item 1) multiplied by the unit value (Item 2)

Service Area

Immokalee Fire Control District provides fire services in 234 square miles of unincorporated Collier County. This area includes urban and rural residential/non-residential structures, agricultural land, and the master-planned community Ave Maria. Given the ability of stations to support each other, the proper benefit district for the provision of fire services is the entire district.

Level of Service

Although fire departments measure level of service in terms of response time, for impact fee calculation purposes, the current level of service (LOS) is calculated based on stations per incidents. As shown in Table 3, the incidents per station is approximately 1,503.

Table 3
Level of Service (2023)

Calculation Step	Figure
Average Number of Incidents (2018, 2019, 2021, 2022) ⁽¹⁾	4,508
Number of Stations ⁽²⁾	3
LOS (Incidents per Station)⁽³⁾	1,503

1) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District. Represents the average annual number of calls between 2018 and 2022, excluding 2020.

2) Source: Table 1

3) Average number of incidents (Item 1) divided by the number of stations (Item 2)

Cost Component

The cost component of the study evaluates the cost of all capital items, including buildings, land, vehicles and equipment. Table 4 provides a summary of all capital assets, which amounts to approximately \$26.4 million.

Since the IFCD is utilizing impact fee revenues to pay off debt service associated with capacity expansion projects, the associated portion of the inventory is excluded from the impact fee calculation. As shown in Table 4, \$5.9 million is excluded from the asset value since it will be paid solely by new development through their future impact fee payments.

Also shown within Table 4 is the total impact cost per incident. As shown, the total impact cost is calculated as \$4,562 per incident. This high cost per incident is reflective of fire departments' utilization levels. Industry standards suggest that fire personnel should not be active more than 30 percent of the time to prevent fatigue and allow for availability and training for effective fire services that meet the response time goals. As a result, fire protection service is relatively expensive on a per incident basis compared to per person basis.

Table 4
Total Impact Cost

Description	Figure	Percent of Total Value ⁽⁹⁾
Building Value ⁽¹⁾	\$19,637,240	74.4%
Land Value ⁽²⁾	\$84,400	0.3%
Vehicle and Equipment Value ⁽³⁾	\$6,697,000	25.3%
Total Capital Asset Value⁽⁴⁾	\$26,418,640	100.0%
Less: Portion Not Owned ⁽⁵⁾	\$5,852,038	
Owned Capital Asset Value⁽⁶⁾	\$20,566,602	
Annual Average Number of Incidents ⁽⁷⁾	4,508	
Total Impact Cost per Incident⁽⁸⁾	\$4,562	

1) Source: Table 1

2) Source: Table 1

3) Source: Table 2

4) Sum of the building value (Item 1), land value (Item 2), and vehicle and equipment value (Item 3)

5) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District

6) Total capital asset value (Item 4) less portion not owned (Item 5)

7) Source: Table 3

8) Owned capital asset value (Item 6) divided by the annual average number of incidents (Item 7)

9) Distribution of building, land and vehicle and equipment values

Net Fire Impact Cost

The net fire impact cost per incident is the difference between the cost component and the credit component. Although the IFCD has been funding all capacity expansion projects with impact fee revenues, a 10-percent credit is incorporated in case the District needs to use some level of non-impact fee revenue sources, which results in conservative fee levels. Table 5 summarizes the calculation of the net fire impact cost per incident. As presented, the net impact cost amounts to approximately \$4,106 per incident.

Table 5
Net Fire Impact Cost

Impact Cost / Credit Element	Per Incident
Impact Cost	
Total Impact Cost ⁽¹⁾	\$4,562
Revenue Credit	
Credit Percentage ⁽²⁾	10%
Credit Amount ⁽³⁾	\$456
Net Impact Cost	
Net Impact Cost ⁽⁴⁾ :	\$4,106

- 1) Source: Table 4
- 2) An estimated 10% credit is provided to give the District the flexibility to use other revenue sources.
- 3) Revenue credit percentage (Item 2) multiplied by total impact cost per incident (Item 1)
- 4) Total impact cost (Item 1) less total revenue credit (Item 3)

Demand Component

Consistent with the District’s current methodology, the fire rescue impact fee demand component is based on incident data. The updated impact fee demand for the fire rescue impact fee is determined by a review of annual incidents and property unit data obtained from the Collier County Property Appraiser. Specifically, the following steps were completed:

- 1) Incident data (2018-2022, excluding 2020) provided by the IFCD was reviewed to determine the average annual number of calls by residential and non-residential land uses. The use of multiple years results in a more reliable average figure. The year 2020 was excluded due to the anomalous impact of the pandemic on the fire rescue service calls.
- 2) A review of property units was conducted to determine the residential and non-residential square footage in the service area of the IFCD.
- 3) Demand coefficients were calculated by dividing the residential and non-residential average annual incidents (2018-2022, excluding 2020) by the total associated square footages, which are presented in Table 6.

**Table 6
Call-Based Demand**

Land Use	Unit	Average Annual Calls (2018, 2019, 2021, 2022) ⁽¹⁾	% Distribution (All Assigned Uses) ⁽²⁾	Distribution of Unassigned Calls ⁽³⁾	Total Calls ⁽⁴⁾	Square Feet ⁽⁵⁾	Incidents per 1,000 square feet ⁽⁶⁾
<i>Calls Assigned to a Land Use</i>							
Residential	1,000 sf	2,402	76.3%	1,038	3,440	14,974,246	0.230
Non-Residential	1,000 sf	745	23.7%	323	1,068	7,320,661	0.146
Total Assigned Calls		3,147	100.0%	1,361	4,508		
<i>Calls Not Assigned to a Land Use</i>							
Other Outside	N/A	702					
Vacant	N/A	261					
Unclassified	N/A	398					
Total Unassigned Calls⁽⁷⁾		1,361					
Total Calls		4,508					

- 1) Source: Immokalee Fire Department. Represents the average annual number of calls during 2018, 2019, 2021 and 2022.
- 2) Percent of assigned calls for residential and non-residential
- 3) Distribution of assigned calls (Item 2) multiplied by the number of total unassigned calls (Item 7)
- 4) Average annual calls (Item 1) plus the distribution of unassigned calls (Item 3)
- 5) Source: Collier County Property Appraiser's Database. Figure reflects total adjusted square footage of buildings within the Immokalee Fire District service area.
- 6) Total calls (Item 4) divided by square feet (Item 5), multiplied by 1,000
- 7) Sum of other outside, vacant and unclassified calls

Calculated Fire Impact Fee Schedule

Based on the analysis presented in this report, a fire impact fee schedule was developed for residential and non-residential land uses, which is presented in Table 7.

Table 7
Calculated Impact Fee Schedule

Land Use	Unit	Incidents per 1,000 Square Feet ⁽²⁾	Calculated Impact Fee per Square Foot ⁽³⁾	Adopted Impact Fee ⁽⁴⁾	Percent Change ⁽⁵⁾
Net Impact Cost per Incident ⁽¹⁾	\$4,106				
Residential	sf	0.230	\$0.94	\$1.11	-15%
Non-Residential	sf	0.146	\$0.60	\$0.32	88%

- 1) Source: Table 5
- 2) Source: Table 6
- 3) Net impact cost per incident (Item 1) multiplied by incidents per 1,000 square feet (Item 2) divided by 1,000
- 4) Source: Collier County Capital Project Planning, Impact Fees, and Program Management Division. Adopted impact fee is assessed per square foot, with a maximum of 4,000 square feet for residential land uses.
- 5) Percent change from adopted impact fee (Item 3) to calculated impact fee (Item 2)

Impact Fee Schedule Comparison

As part of the work effort in updating the IFCD’s fire impact fee program, the current adopted and calculated fees are compared to the fees adopted by other fire districts and cities within Collier County. Table 8 presents this comparison. As shown, the calculated fees are within the range of the fees charged by the jurisdictions reviewed.

Table 8
Fire Impact Fee Schedule Comparison

Land Use	Unit ⁽²⁾	Immokalee Fire		City of Naples ⁽⁵⁾	Greater Naples Fire District ⁽⁶⁾	City of Marco Island ⁽⁷⁾	North Collier Fire District ⁽⁸⁾	Ochopee Fire District ⁽⁹⁾
		Calculated Fee ⁽³⁾	Adopted Fee ⁽⁴⁾					
Date of Last Update		2023	2006	2007	2022	2002	2020	2010
Adoption Percentage ⁽¹⁾		N/A	100%	100%	100%	N/A	100%	100%
Residential:								
Single Family (2,000 sf)	du	\$1,880	\$2,220	\$337	\$866	\$570	\$476	\$1,200
Non-Residential:								
Light Industrial	1,000 sf	\$600	\$320	\$190	\$433	\$210	\$1,060	\$680
Office (50,000 sq ft)	1,000 sf	\$600	\$320	\$310	\$433	\$350	\$1,060	\$680
Retail (125,000 sq ft)	1,000 sf	\$600	\$320	\$900	\$433	\$990	\$1,060	\$680
Bank w/Drive-Thru	1,000 sf	\$600	\$320	\$1,240	\$433	\$1,360	\$1,060	\$680
Fast Food w/Drive-Thru	1,000 sf	\$600	\$320	\$1,240	\$433	\$1,360	\$1,060	\$680

- 1) Represents the portion of the maximum calculated fee for each respective municipality/district that is actually charged. Fee may have been lowered/increased through annual indexing or policy discounts. Does not account for moratorium/suspensions.
- 2) du = dwelling unit
- 3) Source: Table 7
- 4) Source: Collier County Capital Project Planning, Impact Fees, and Program Management Division
- 5) Source: City of Naples, Ordinance 08-11954. Bank with drive through and fast food with drive through land uses reflect fee for "any other not classified."
- 6) Source: Collier County Capital Project Planning, Impact Fees, and Program Management Division
- 7) Source: City of Marco Island, Florida Code of Ordinances, Sec. 30-869 - Appendix A, Impact Fee Rates
- 8) Source: Collier County Capital Project Planning, Impact Fees, and Program Management Division
- 9) Source: Collier County Capital Project Planning, Impact Fees, and Program Management Division

Appendix A
Building and Land Value Analysis
Supplemental Information

Appendix A

This appendix provides additional data and information on building and land value estimates.

Building Values

In determining the appropriate unit cost for building construction, the following analyses were conducted:

- A review of cost associated with recently built stations;
- A review of construction cost estimates for future stations;
- A review of cost associated with recently built or bid fire stations in other Florida jurisdictions;
- Review of the insurance values of existing stations; and
- Discussions with the District staff.

The most recently constructed fire station, Station 32, was built for approximately \$435 per square foot, excluding land infrastructure. The cost associated with Station 30 that is under construction is estimated at \$425 per square foot.

Benesch obtained cost information from several jurisdictions to supplement the local data. The bids and estimates received between 2019 and 2022 ranged from \$270 to \$525 per square foot.

Insurance values of existing fire stations averaged \$346 per square foot. It should be noted that insurance values are considered conservative estimates because insurance companies exclude the value of the foundation and other more permanent parts of the structure that would not have to be rebuilt if the structure was damaged.

Given this information, an average value of \$430 per square foot was used for fire stations. Table A-1 summarizes this information.

**Table A-1
Building Cost per Square Foot**

Description	Year	Cost per Square Foot
Station 32 ⁽¹⁾	2023	\$437
Station 30 ⁽²⁾	2023	\$427
Insurance Values ⁽³⁾	2023	\$346
Other Florida Jurisdictions ⁽⁴⁾	2019-2022	\$270 - \$525
Used in the Study		
		\$430

- 1) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District. Initial engineer and architect fees were incurred in the 14/15 and 15/16 fiscal years, with the majority of the construction costs expended from 2020 forward.
- 2) Immokalee Fire Control District. Replacement of an existing station. Construction expected to be completed in 2023.
- 3) Source: Immokalee Fire Control District
- 4) Source: Local Florida Governments

Land Values

To determine land value for future fire station land purchases, the following data/information was evaluated:

- The land value of parcels where the current fire stations are located, obtained from the Collier County Property Appraiser’s database;
- Appraisals for recent land acquisitions;
- Vacant land sales and land values of all vacant land in areas where future fire stations are planned to be built; and
- Land use characteristics of the areas where future fire stations will be located.

The value of current parcels as reported by the Property Appraiser averages \$102,000 per acre with a range of \$48,000 per acre to \$175,000 per acre. The District acquired using impact fee credits a section of land that was appraised at approximately \$43,000 per acre. Discussions with the District indicated that future stations will be in agricultural land which typically has lower land values. Given this, the land value per acre is estimated at \$40,000 per acre.